THE RELATIVE EFFECTIVENESS OF CONTEMPORARY TRAINING METHODS OF NIGERIAN CORPORATE ORGANIZATIONS: (A CASE STUDY OF EMPLOYEE OF COMMERCIAL BANKS IN OWERRI, IMO STATE NIGERIA)

[1]Damian Mbaegbu, PhD & [2]Love Obiani Arugu, PhD
[1&2]*Department of Political Science/Strategic Studies*
Federal University, Otuoke, Nigeria

Abstract
This paper critically analyzed the effectiveness of contemporary training techniques of Nigerian corporate organizations in collectively preparing employees to execute national, integrated, inclusive and sustainable development strategies. The study chose the case study design and focused on a cluster sample of employees of commercial banks in Owerri. The instrument of data collection was a purposefully constructed questionnaire calibrated with ordinal measurement scale. The responses were subjected to descriptive and inferential statistical analyses. The findings were that the key training methods namely lecture methods, workshops; conferences and so on differed in their effectiveness in meeting training needs. The conclusion was that a training method ranked high for skill acquisition, for example, may not necessarily rank high for knowledge acquisition. The researchers therefore recommended that corporate organizations should appraise their training methods before using them for particular needs in order to collectively contribute to integrated, inclusive and sustainable national development.

Keywords: Training, Development, Inclusive Integrated and Sustainable Development, Training Needs/Objectives.

Background to the study
Training and development are two related intervention programmed or planned change efforts used by Human Resources Managers to enhance their employee's job performances in order to meet the challenges of organizational development as well as national development strategies. In every economy it is the corporate organizations in the public and the organized private sectors that drive the national development efforts. To be able to perform effectively the human resources employed by these organizations must be skilled in the best global practices, have knowledge of up to date state of the art and be attuned to the right attitudinal and emotional dispositions. This can only be achieved through training and management development. As amply demonstrated by Harbison (1973 p.77):

Human resources, not capital constitute the ultimate basis for the wealth of a nation or an enterprise. Capital and natural resources are passive factors of production. Human beings are the active agents who accumulate wealth, exploit natural resources, build social, economic and political organizations and carry forward national development. Clearly a country or an enterprise which is unable to develop skills and knowledge of its people and utilize them effectively will be unable to develop or produce any other thing. In this paper we analyzed the relative effectiveness of the contemporary training and development methods for their particular usefulness in satisfying relevant training needs namely: skill acquisition, knowledge acquisition and attitudinal changes. The commercial banks were selected for the case study because of the pivotal roles they play in National Development.

Statement of Research Problem
The problem that prompted this study related to the effectiveness of contemporary training methods in meeting training needs of employees who would drive development efforts. The problem was considered from three perspectives namely effectiveness for skill acquisition, knowledge acquisition and attitudinal change.

Objectives of the Study
Given the stated problem the researchers sought to achieve the following objectives.
1. To investigate if there were significant differences in the impacts of training methods in skill acquisition.
2. To find out if training methods differed in their impacts on knowledge acquisition.
3. To determine if training methods, differed in their impacts on attitudinal changes.

Statement of Hypotheses
i. Ho: There are no significant differences in the impacts of training methods on changing employee attitudes ($P < 0.05$).
ii. Ho: There are no significant differences in the impacts of training methods on employee skill acquisition ($P < 0.05$).
iii. Ho: There are no significant differences in the impact training methods on employee acquisition of knowledge ($P < 0.05$).

Review of Related Literature
The review of related literature on this study is organized as follows:
a. The conceptual issues
b. The theoretical framework
c. Further review of empirical and other studies.

Conceptual Issues

In many human resources management literature and texts training and development (T & D) are used concurrently and synonymously as though they were one and the same (Adeleke, 2000; Harrison, 2005). However, there are conceptual differences between the two as intervention or change processes (McGehee & Thayer, 1961; Armstrong, 2010,).

Training

Training programs are staggered and discrete learning experiences organized from time to time as the need arises in order to make employees improve upon their productive efforts on their current job demands (Mbaegbu, 2000). In training four objectives are aimed at namely: skill acquisition, expansion of knowledge particularly knowledge of present job one is employed to do, the acquisition of the right attitude to work and finally adaptation to new work environment, demands and philosophy . This last objective is very important. As Belbir (1987) observed an employee transferred to a new environment may have challenges of adaptation, find old skills become obsolete or even have challenge of 'managing" a new boss (Hoover, 2014). However, one basic fact about training is that it is applied more, but not exclusively, to junior employees particularly the beginners who are still learning how to execute their functions. For example one has to be trained to operate a machine or acquire a new skill to execute the task demands of a new job or drop the habit of lateness and absenteeism as attitudes

Development

Development programmed differs from training programmed basically in scope (Armstrong, 2010). They are a continuous and long term learning experiences designed to make the employee grow on the job and be able to take higher responsibilities, perform leadership roles or apply managerial skills to solve problems. Development, therefore, does not entail a one day effort like organizing a work shop. The effort is comprehensive and it is nurtured by the work environment. For example an officer who is on relief duty, acting in place of his boss who is on leave, is being developed. Similarly leadership "courses" for the development of analytical mind through case studies is also a development programmed. Before an employee gets to the stage of being developed to perform management roles and apply managerial skills he or she must have passed through the mills and attended a lot of training programmed that will cumulatively prepare him or her for the higher position of leadership. As stated by Mintezberg (cited in Rue and Byars, 2003) the role expectation of management development programmed such as understudy, case studies or study leave or management education at College. Polytechnic and University includes the following: Interpersonal roles to handle human relations, informational roles to function as resources allocator and entrepreneurship (employee who is entrepreneurial in approach). The skills as detailed by Mintzberg   cited supra included conceptual skills to be able to think imaginatively, human skills for emotional intelligence and technical skill to perform special task with efficiency and demonstrate to followers or subordinates. However, every employee can

undergo training depending on his or her personal training needs (Cohn, Khurana & Reeves, 2005). A top manager, depending on his talents and needs of his job environment can be trained to perfect his potentials – acquire entrepreneurial skills or strategic thinking skill to reposition his company in the environment. This is why at the management level experts talk of management training and development. According to Kubr and Prokopenko (1989 p. 9):

Management training and development are defined as a set of activities where by practitioners-managers or would be managers- are assisted in improving their individual competence and performance as well as the organizational environment with the ultimate goal of raising the standard of organizational performance. In recent times some buzz words have come to be used as synonyms for training and development. They include learning and development, career development, talent development etc. (Harrison, 2005).

Contemporary Training Methods of Nigerian Corporate Organization
There are many training methods available to trainers and training directors. However those that are commonly used in Nigeria include the following: lecture, seminar, conference workshop, job rotation, Programmed Instruction and computer assisted compact disk (CD) methods.

In the Lecturers method as stated by Nwochie, (1997) training materials are presented verbally by the lecturer and used when the goal is to address a large audience. Conferences unlike the lecture method are a discussion method. Seminars are like conferences but the audiences invariably are professional members or academic groups. The workshop is a special kind of conferencing designed to equip participants with skills. In job rotation trainees are put on different jobs within the organization for specified periods of time. The programmed instruction method breaks the learning material into stages so that the learner can proceed at his or her own pace from the first stage following the programmed or handbook. Finally the computer assisted method makes use of compact disks or CD ROM or video disc and loud speakers and the learner interacts with the computer.

Theoretical Frame work
Training and development are both a professional field of social action originating from the Social Action Theory (Ritzer, 2008) and an area of scientific inquiry relating to the early management theories (Rue & Byars, 2003). Social action theorists postulate that society or a social unit such as a corporate organization develops through a process of action and reaction; give and take. The organization gives to its members by way of training in order to expect good performances. As a field of scientific enquiry training and development are as old as management process. F.W Taylor prescribed that training employees in the "one best way" enhanced employee job performance. (Taylor, 1911). Henri Fayol also prescribed 14 principles of management (Fayol, 1916). Training and development can also be located as byproducts of the theories of change. The most popular

by the avoidance of lateness to work, working to achieve shareholder satisfaction, customer satisfaction, loyalty and so on. In a survey of Fortune's largest 500 corporations Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972) rated nine different training methods for achieving each of six training objectives and the lecture method of training was rated 8th on an ordinal sale from 1 to 9 with regard to changing attitudes. The sensitivity training (T-group) was rated first, the role playing method was rated 2nd while the conference was rated 3rd. unfortunately role playing and T-group methods are not popular in Nigeria. The lecture method has also been downgraded by McGehee and Thayer, (1961).

Training is Skill Acquisition

A skill is knowledge translated into practice. While knowledge of the best global practices is important in implementing development strategies skill is the activity that produces result; an object. An employee might know all the principles and techniques theoretically but might not be able to practice them on the job. There is therefore a big difference between knowing principles and techniques and using them on the job. For skill acquisition literature has it that the training methods also deferred in their effectiveness in the extant study of Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972 pp 495-509). The case study method was rated 1st for problem solving skill, business games rated 2nd, role playing was rated 3rd and the conference method was rated 4th and once again the lecture method was rated last; on the 9th position. Unfortunately, it is only the lecture method and the conference method that are popular among corporate organizations in Nigeria. In interpersonal skill the conference was rated 3rd and lecture was rated 8th. By Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972).

Training and Knowledge Acquisition

Knowledge relates to the facts, information, principles and theory a person has acquired through experience or education. It is an organized body of information shared by people in a particular field of learning. In corporate organization knowledge refers to the state of the art; the awareness of the global best practices and bends marks. Training as a change agent is used to increase the knowledge of the employees so that ignorance is reduced and people are driven by knowledge sharing in the execution of their jobs for sustainable competitive advantage (Bryant, 2005 pp 319-38). However, the training methods rated high in the developed countries for their effectiveness in knowledge acquisition are not popular among Nigerian trainers. They include programmed instruction, role playing and case study methods. In Carroll, Paine and Invancevich, (1972) the conference method was rated 5th and lecture was rated 8th.

Methodology

The study adopted the case study research design using commercial banks in Owerri, Nigeria for the case. The population of study comprised of all Commercial bank employees in the country.

change theory is the Lewin's Change Model (Cummings & Worley 2001). Kurt Lewin conceived change as the outcome of the modification of two opposing forces: Those keeping a system temporarily stable in a state of "quasi- stationary equilibrium" and those pushing for a change. Lewin suggests that modifying those forces maintaining the status- quo produces less tension and resistance than quickening the forces pressing for immediate change and revolution. Education, Training and Development are change agents that can modify a system and produce less tension.

Learning, Training and Development

Learning is the bed rock of Training and development. Learning has been defined as any change in behavior as a result of a particular experience (Graham, 1978. p. 27). An effective training and development technique should foster learning. A training method that does not result into learning is a waste of scarce funds and time. A training method should be designed with respect to the principles and psychology of learning: a task which involves difficult perception should be broken down into parts and taught. However, part learning becomes ineffective when the task to be learnt loses its motivation unless it is learnt as a whole.

Also a structured learning experience should be followed by practice session in order to ensure assimilation. According to Graham cited supra, learning also becomes effective when rest periods are alternated with learning experiences because of the concept of learning plateau. This is the generalization that for most people learning progresses in a curve. There is a steep upward slopping curve at the initial stage of learning. This followed by a horizontal curve depicting the stage the leaner makes no progress or the learning plateau stage. This stage is followed by another steep upward slopping curve when the learner begins again to make progress. The learning plateau is said to exist because of the need for the learner to mentally organize his or her thought processes for association and assimilation. A good training method should also have in built transfer learning mechanism. This is the ability to associate a particular learning experience with what had been learnt earlier i.e. previous knowledge (P.K.).

Further Review of Literature: Training and Attitudinal Change

An attitude is a psychological construct or mental images of abstract things. Luthan (2006 p. 79) defines attitude as 'an individual's characteristic way of responding to an object or situation… based on this experience and it leads to certain behavioral tendencies or expression of certain opinions". Luthan (2006) also differentiated attitudinal behavior from short-lived and transitory behavior propelled by a need (motivated behavior). Therefore, attitudes persist even when all needs are for the time being met while motivated behavior occurs only when the need arises. At the work place, attitudes provide predetermined set of responses. They define the employees predisposition toward aspects of the work (Ogundele, 2007 p. 31). Attitude can, however, be changed. One sure way of achieving attitudinal change is through training. The positive attitudes the employer requires of the employee are commitment and job satisfaction which are manifested

However, because of the difficulty of estimating the population and doing a survey from a sampling frame we decided to use a cluster sample of bank managers and officers who have attended training courses for the case study. Training Managers and Directors were in the various head offices and could not be easily accessed. The cluster sample was made up of male and female employee and it was stratified in the old Owerri business district. All Commercial Banks in Nigeria were represented in the sample of 100 staffers who responded to our case study questionnaire code named LETMQ (Learning Effectiveness of Training Methods Questionnaire). The response rate was 90% and the primary data collected were empirically analyzed using descriptive (percentile) and inferential (chi-squared) statistics. The chi-squared statistic was employed to test the hypotheses. Presentation and Analysis of Data The primary data were first presented in the

Table 1: Frequency Distribution of Scores and Percentages for the Effectiveness of Training Methods.

S/N	Training Method	Effectiveness in Changing Attitudes	Effectiveness in Skill Acquisition	Effectiveness in Knowledge Acquisition
1	Lecture	20 (23%)	13 (14%)	45 (50%)
2	Seminar	22 (24%)	6 (7%)	20 (23%)
3	Conference	30 (33%)	15 (17%)	10 (11%)
4	Workshop	10 (11%)	32 (35%)	8 (9%)
5	Job Rotation	8 (9%)	20 (23%)	2 (2%)
6	Programmed Instruction	0 (0%)	2 (2%)	3 (3%)
7	Computer Assisted Compact Disk	0 90%)	2 (2%)	2 (2%)
8	Total	90 (100%)	90 (100%)	90 (100%)

Source: Field work

Interpretation of Data Analysis
The presentation of scores in table 1 shows that 30 (33%) of the respondent sample subjects scored the conference method of training most effective (1s) for changing the attitude of employees. The seminar method was scored second highest (2nd) by 22 respondents (24%) and the lecture method was scored 3rd by 20 respondents (23%). With regard to skill acquisition the workshop was scored 1st by 32 respondents (35%). Job rotation was scored 2nd by 20 respondents (23%) and the conference came 3rd. In knowledge acquisition 45 respondents (50%) scored the lecture method 1st . The seminar method came 2nd with 20 respondents (23%) while the conference method came 3rd by 10 respondents. The other training methods were respectively scored very low for each of the three training objectives.

Inferential Analysis and Test of Hypotheses using Chi-square ($X2$) Statistic

The Chi-squared goodness of fit analysis is presented in the contingency tables below using the $X2$ formular:

$$X2 = \frac{(O-E)2}{E}$$

Table 2: $X2$ Contingency Table for the Effectiveness of Training Methods in Changing Attitudes of Employees.

S/N	Category	Observed Frequency	Expected Frequencies	Total = ? $\frac{(O-E)2}{E}$
1	Lecture	20	12.857	3.968
2	Seminar	22	12.857	6.502
3	Conference	30	12.857	22.585
4	Workshop	10	12.857	0.635
5	Job Rotation	8	12.857	1.835
6	Programmed Instruction	0	12.857	12.857
7	Computer Assisted	0	12.857	12.857
	Total	90	90	61.512

Source: Field work

Hypothesis 1

Ho: Attitudes. There are no significant differences in the impacts of training method in changing employees attitudes ($P < 0.05$).

From the $X2$ analysis in table 2 we note that t 0.05 significant level and 6 degrees of freedom the critical value of $X2 = 12.592$ the calculated value of

$X2 = 61.512$.

Decision: We reject the null hypothesis and uphold the alternate hypothesis; there are significant differences in the impacts of training methods in changing employees

Table 3: X^2 Contingency Table for the Effectiveness of Training Me thods in Employee Skill Acquisition.

S/N	Category	Observed Frequency	Expected Frequencies	Total = ? $\frac{(O-E)2}{E}$
1	Lecture	13	12.857	0.003
2	Seminar	6	12.857	3.657
3	Conference	15	12.857	0.357
4	Workshop	32	12.857	28.502
5	Job Rotation	20	12.857	3.968
6	Programmed Instruction	2	12.857	9.168
7	Computer Assisted	2	12.857	9.168
	Total	90	90	61.512

Source: Field Work

Hypothesis 2

Ho: There are no significant differences in the impact of training methods on employee skill acquisition ($p \leq 0.05$).

From the X2 analysis in table 3 we note that at 0.05 significant level and 6 degrees of freedom the critical value of $X2 = 2.592$ and the calculated value of $X2 = 54.823$.

Decision: We reject the null hypothesis and uphold the alternate hypothesis; there are significant differences in the impact of training methods on employee skill acquisition ($P < 0.05$).

Table 4: X^2 Contingency Table for the Effectiveness of Training Method in Employee knowledge Acquisition.

S/N	Category	Observed Frequency	Expected Frequencies	Total = ? $\frac{(O-E)2}{E}$
1	Lecture	45	12.857	80.359
2	Seminar	20	12.857	3.968
3	Conference	10	12.857	0.635
4	Workshop	8	12.857	1.835
5	Job Rotation	2	12.857	9.168
6	Programmed Instruction	3	12.857	7.557
7	Computer Assisted	2	12.857	9.168
	Total	90	90	61.512

Source: Field Work

Hypothesis 3

Ho: There are no significant differences in the impact of training methods in employee's acquisition of knowledge ($P < 0.05$).

From the X2 analysis in table 4 we note that at 0.05 significant level and 6 degrees of freedom the critical value of $X2 = 12.592$ and the calculated value is 112.690.

Decision: We reject the null hypothesis and uphold the alternate hypothesis; there are significant differences in the impact of training methods on employee acquisition of knowledge ($P < 0.05$).

Findings

Our analysis of data shows that the various training methods used by Nigerian corporate organizations differ in their relative effectiveness in the achievement of training objectives. The conference method is relatively more effective in attitudinal change. The workshop is relatively more effective in skill acquisition while the lecture method is relatively more effective in knowledge acquisition.

Discussion of Findings

Although there have been some distant studies on the effectiveness of training methods abroad we are not aware of any such studies in Nigeria. We can cite Mc Gehee and Thayer (1961); Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972). This instant study seeks to fill the knowledge gap.

In the acquisition of knowledge Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972) at < 0.01 level of significance ranked the lecturer method 9th on a scale from 1 to 9 involving the following methods: Case Study, Conference, Business Games, Movie Films, Programmed Instruction, Role Playing, Sensitivity Training and Television Lecture. Majority of these methods are, however, not popular among Nigerian corporate organizations. This may be probably due to our level of development. Consequently, the lecture method was scored 1st in our instant study by 45 respondents (50%). In changing attitudes the conference was ranked 3rd by Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972) but in our study it was scored 1st. The conference was also ranked 4th in problem solving skill by Carroll, Paine and Ivancevich (1972) but in our study it was scored 3rd for skill acquisition. Our findings are, therefore, more or less consistent with Carroll, Paine and ivancevich (1972) for the concurrent methods studied. The slight differences could be attributed to differences in population of study and levels of development between Nigeria and the U.S.

Conclusion

This paper is a case study on the effectives of training and development methods. Training and development are sine qua non for effective organizational performance and growth. While training aims at preparing the employee to be able to execute current jobs efficiently developmental programmed aim at making the employee a more responsible personnel who is ready to handle more complex tasks to position or reposition the organization as a key player in the environment so that collectively the human resources will drive the national development strategies in an integrated inclusive and sustainable manner.

Recommendations

1   Corporate organizations should study research findings before using any training method since all training methods do not have the same impact on achieving particular training objectives.

2   Government should subsidize training costs through the Industrial Training Fund (ITF) since it is the trained employees of corporate organizations who collectively drive national development plans for sustainable the development.

References

Adeleke, A. (2000). "The Role of training and development in enhancing corporate growth & survival. Human Resources Management", Journal of the Institute of Personnel Management of Nigeria. Vol. 10 (5) Pp 34-41.

Armstrong, M (2010). "A handbook of human resources management practice. London: Kogan page 25 p. 25

Belbir, O (1987). "Training in business & industry". New York: John Wiley.

Bryant, S.E (2006) "The impact of peer mentoring on organizational knowledge creation & sharing"; An empirical study in a software firm. Group & Organization management ,Vol 30 No 3 pp319-38.

Carroll, S.J, Paine, P.T. &Ivancevich, , J.J. (1972). "The relative effectiveness of training methods" expert opinion & research Personnel Psychology 25 (5) 495-510.

Cohn, J.M, Khurana, R & Reeves, L. (2005). "Growing talent as if your Business Depended on it. Harvard Business Review 83 (10) 62-70.

Cummings, T.G. & Worley, C.G. (2003)".Essentials of organizational development & change" UK: South-Western College Pub, Thompson Learning.

Fayol, H. (1929) "General & industrial management Trans. By J.A Conbrough Geneva: Industrial Management Institute.

Graham, HT (1987)."Human resources management". Stover, Plymouth: MaDonald & Econs Ltd.

Goldstein, A.P. & Sorcher, M (1974)."Changing supervisor behavior". New York Pergamon Press Inc.

Harbison, F. H (1973) "Human resources as the wealth of nations". New York: Oxford University Press, p. 77

Harrison, R (2005) "Learning & development London" :The Chartered Institute of Personnel &Development ISBN 9781843980506 p.5

Hoover, J. (2014)."How to work for an Idiot". http://www.amazon.com/dp/ 15614147045. Retrieved 15th March.

Kibbee, J.M Craft C.J. & Nanus B.(2001)."Management games: A new technique for management development" New York: Reinhold Pub. Co.

Kubr, M & Prokopenko, J. (1989)."Diagnosing management training & development needs": Management Development Series No. 27 Geneva: International Labour Office ILO p.9.

Likert, R. (1967)."The human organization: Its management & value. New York: McGraw-Hill p.1

Maier, K. (2000). This house has fallen: Nigeria in Crisis London: Penguin.

Mbaegbu, D. (2000)."A critical appraisal of training methods of training managers". Unpublished Conference Paper Presented at the Train the Trainers Conference, African Continental Bank Staff Training & Management Development Centre Yaba, Lagos.

McGehee, W. Thayer, A. (1961)."Training in business &" industry. New York: John Wiley.

Nwaochei, B.N (1997)."Getting the best out of your training budget". Management in Nigeria Journal of Nigeria institute of Management.Vol 33 No. 1 Jan – March.

Taylor F.W (1911)."The principles of scientific management". New York Haper & Row.

Thompson, A.A, Gamble, J.E & Strickland, AJ. (2004)."Strategy: Winning in the market place". New York: McGraw Hill Irwin.

Rue, L.W & Byara, LL (2003) "Management". New York: Irwin McGrwa-Hill.

Ritzer, G. (2008). "Sociological theory". New York: McGraw-Hill.

Strauss, G. & Sayless, L.R (1981) "Managing human resources". New York: Prentice-Hall Inc.

Wexley, K.N & Yukl, GA (1978)."Organizational behaviour & personnel psychology". Homewood, Illinois: Richard D. Irwin Inc.